

White Counselor Education Faculty on the Topics of Racism and Privileges in the Classroom: A Personal Journey

Michael Brooks¹, Tyra Whittaker², & Yudan Wang³

¹ Full Professor, North Carolina A&T State University, United States

²Liberty University, United States

³ North Carolina A&T State University, United States

Correspondence: Michael Brooks, North Carolina A&T State University, United States.

Received: February 21, 2023	Accepted: April 12, 2023	Available online: April 26, 2023
doi:10.11114/ijsss.v11i3.5927	URL: https://doi.org/10.111	14/ijsss.v11i3.5927

Abstract

Engaging in critical conversations about race and racism requires counselor educators to be courageous and fearless. The current study explored how White counselor educators engage in honest discussions regarding race and racism. Using semi-structured interviews, three White counselor educators from CACREP Accredited programs were interviewed to explore their experiences of fearlessly leading courageous conversations on race and racism. A thematic analysis yielded three consistent themes, including a pattern centered around creating a safe space for discussions, being okay with being imperfect, and encounters that transform. The last theme also had two sub-themes: constructing intentional relationships with truth-tellers and world-changing experiences. These findings offer insight for White counselor educators to traverse challenges associated with having provocative conversations about race and racism, both inside and outside of the classroom.

Keywords: accreditation, counselor education, race, racism, safe space, white faculty

1. Introduction

The topic of racism is one of the most emotionally charged subjects of our time. The need to address race and racial prejudice issues within counselor education has become the subject of discourse among authors interested in multicultural education (Roysircar et al., 2005; Toporek, Ortega-Villalobos, & Pope-Davis, 2004). Social scientists concur that a key to racial healing involves meaningful dialogue among racial groups (Dalton, 1995; Tatum, 1997). Kivel (1996) said, "Talking about racism lessens its power [and] . . . allows us to do something about it" (p. 95). Appropriately and effectively facilitating racial dialogues has been shown to reduce prejudice, increase compassion, dispel stereotypes, and promote mutual respect and understanding (Willow, 2008).

Classroom interactions present multiple learning opportunities for professors to use racial dialogues to explore hidden biases. Nevertheless, honest discussions about race and racism have proved a significant challenge for most White educators, who appear reluctant or ambivalent in addressing these topics with students of various backgrounds or even among themselves (Sue, 2005). These volatile classroom racial dynamics may impede instructor teaching and restrict student learning while simultaneously fostering the development and maintenance of microaggressions (Sue et al., 2007). The tense classroom environment also can facilitate the development of difficult dialogues on race (Sue et al., 2009).

Difficult dialogues on race threaten conversations or interactions between members of different racial or ethnic groups (Sue, Lin, et al., 2009). These dialogues prevent faculty and students from revealing intimate thoughts, beliefs, or feelings about racial prejudice or bias (Sue et al., 2011). The uncomfortable feelings from the dialogues may foster students' negative biases towards the classroom. Negative biases may affect faculty evaluations, thus hindering, especially for junior faculty members, professional progress. As such, it is conceivable that faculty members explicitly or implicitly avoid classroom racial conversations.

On the other hand, professors who work towards developing rapport and stimulating engagement within their classrooms are presented with negative feedback if students do not view the learning environment as conducive to progressive learning (Wood, 2012). Perception creates meaning as individuals select, organize, and interpret information from the environment (Brooks et al., 2017). This is particularly true for students who meet in a single location for at least three

hours per week. As White faculty members are the potential figures projecting racism, it is crucial to examine how their development in racial understanding and how they build a supportive education environment conducive to candid racial conversations.

1.1 Current Socio-political Climate

The devastating impact of COVID-19, coupled with the countless murders of African

Americans' acts of aggression against Asian Americans, and the dehumanizing treatment of Hispanic Americans and refugees in the past few years, have brought discussions of race and racism to the forefront (Whittaker, 2019). The legal concept of Critical Race Theory (CRT) has also emerged as a topic of debate and contention, especially in the K-12 environment. Counselor education is not immune to these discussions. The classroom has become an incubator where socio-political talks are held and frequently debated. Facilitating challenging conversations in the school requires awareness, knowledge, and stamina on behalf of the counselor educator (Chan et al., 2018).

1.2 Code of Ethics

Section F of the American Counseling Association's Code of Ethics (2014) offers guidance in delivering ethical counselor education and supervision practices. Regarding diversity specifically, Section F.7.c. mandates that "counselor educators infuse materials related to multiculturalism/diversity into all courses and workshops for the development of professional counselors" (ACA, 2014, p.14). Additionally, Section F.11.c. states that counselors must "actively infuse multicultural/diversity competency in their training and supervision practices. They actively train students to gain awareness, knowledge, and skills in the competencies of multicultural practice" (ACA, 2014, p.15). Failure to adhere to the outlined standards poses an ethical violation and compromises the preparation of culturally competent counselors, consequently impacting the clients served. Adhering to these standards provides guidance and allows the freedom to effectively meet the needs of diverse populations. The code of ethics can also serve as a means to ensure the health and viability of academic programs to produce highly qualified counselors. As such, the code provides a framework for successful accreditation.

1.3 Accreditation

The Council for Accreditation of Counseling & Related Educational Programs (CACREP) requires programs to include curricula in social and cultural diversity (CACREP, 2015). More specifically, accredited programs must consist of the following:

- 1) multicultural and pluralistic characteristics within and among diverse groups nationally and internationally
- 2) theories and models of multicultural counseling, cultural identity development, and social justice and advocacy
- 3) multicultural counseling competencies
- 4) the impact of heritage, attitudes, beliefs, understandings, and acculturative experiences on an individual's views of others
- 5) the effects of power and privilege on counselors and clients
- 6) help-seeking behaviors of diverse clients
- 7) the impact of spiritual beliefs on clients' and counselors' worldviews
- 8) strategies for identifying and eliminating barriers, prejudices, and processes of intentional and unintentional oppression and discrimination (pp.10-11)

Although the Council for Accreditation of Counseling & Related Educational Programs (CACREP) standards require covering multicultural and social justice content, not all counselor educators are comfortable addressing such topics. Counselor educators may find teaching multicultural counseling challenging, especially if they need to be equipped to handle these topics through training, lived experiences, or a combination thereof. However, these emotional and cognitive roadblocks are unacceptable reasons for abdicating the responsibility of preparing students to advocate for minoritized populations. The counselor educator's purposeful course design is equally essential in addressing the broad spectrum of diversity and not merely addressing topics in which the counselor educator is comfortable.

It is vital that counselor educators educate students on not only multicultural and social justice concepts but also model cultural humility, which the educator themselves must possess and demonstrate (Atkins & Lorelle, 2022). Counselor educators must commit indefinitely to self-reflection and assessment to understand and respect other cultures and become aware of their cultural identity (Tervalon & Murray-Garcia, 1998; Yeager & Bauer-Wu, 2013; Zhu & Bellini, 2021). Possessing cultural humility can allow the counselor educator to approach teaching and learning as a servant-leader in the

student's journey toward cultural competence. If properly employed, cultural humility can serve as a springboard for creating a climate of safety in the classroom.

1.4 Creating a Climate of Safety

Haskins and Singh (2015) challenged counselor educators to create a safe climate to address topics on racism in the classroom and explore their own beliefs about racism. Haskins and Singh (2015) provide counselor educators with strategies to conduct a rigorous self-evaluation of internal attitudes and beliefs about racism. Creating a safe environment requires a willingness to share vulnerability and take risks on behalf of the counselor, educator, and student. However, there are many challenges in dialogues on privileges, mainly as it involves managing emotions of fear, "guilt," and "shame" experienced by both the counselor educator and the student (Chan et al., 2018, p.64). Students from minoritized populations may also share anger, resentment, fear, and vulnerability as difficult conversations about race and racism are held (Chan et al., 2018).

Conversations about racism and oppression can be emotionally charged but should not be avoided. Counselor educators are encouraged to embrace and practice multicultural and social justice competencies to shepherd students toward cultural competence effectively. Although some White faculty may find this practice challenging and uncomfortable, increasing the counselor educator's cultural competence begins with self-awareness.

2. Theoretical Framework-Critical Race Theory

Critical Race Theory (CRT) provides the theoretical structure to understand White counselor educators' struggle in racially charged dialogues with racial minority students. Soloronzo et al. (2000) define CRT as developing a pedagogy, curriculum, and research agenda for the role of race and racism in United States education systems that works toward ending discrimination and subordination of students of color. The CRT framework in education is grounded in the following five principles: a) convergence of race and racism with other forms of subordination, b) challenge to the dominant ideology, c) commitment to social justice, d) centrality of experiential knowledge, and e) transdisciplinary perspective (Solorzano et al., 2000). Collectively, the above principles challenge the dominant theoretical frameworks employed in education research. CRT in education research has aimed to answer questions about how educational institutions maintain racism, sexism, and classism (Soloronzo & Yosso, 2001), including a) How do academic structure, processes, and discourse function to support racism? b) How do students of color resist racism in theoretical systems, processes, and discourse? Moreover, c) How can educational reforms help end racism in educational institutions (Soloronzo & Yosso, 2001)?

CRT scholars have affirmed that higher education institutes are the most appropriate setting to discuss CRT and race's role in the education system (Schwalbe, 2009). An introduction to the tenets of the theory and, indeed, to an accurate history of the United States, warts, and all, in schools is essential to equip counseling and counselor education students with the correct information to confront racial realities that may be otherwise very uncomfortable. CRT extinguishes unproductive guilt and brings together people who want to create an America that lives up to its ideals of fairness and meritocracy. Those counselor educators share this ideal link CRT to our current study.

We explored the experiences of White counselor educators who have fearlessly engaged in courageous conversations about race and racism in the academy. More specifically, we wanted to know more about the upbringing, personal experiences, and academic training that prompted them to embrace antiracist teaching pedagogy. We also explored what embracing vulnerability and, at times, combatting complicity looks like in and out of the classroom. We felt that our study was unique in that we were able to explore the importance of honest discussions on race and racism and how these White faculty became comfortable with such provocative dialogue. Additionally, our study looks at the challenges of maintaining openness and the gains from a White person engaging in difficult dialogues (such as race/racism).

3. Methodology

A qualitative design ensures that the voices and stories of those White faculty who teach multicultural counseling – hence who regularly engage in race dialogues – are heard. Scientists and researchers have used qualitative inquiry for centuries (Bernard, 2013). Qualitative research effectively addresses problems needing deeper exploration around a specific phenomenon (Creswell & Creswell, 2018). A qualitative research method allows for the amplification of the voices of the participants by studying things and events in their natural setting and making sense of them as seen by those experiencing them (Creswell & Poth, 2015). Qualitative researchers engage in this research by providing a detailed analysis of participants' words through fieldwork, recordings, photographs, artistic representations, interviews, and conversations (Creswell & Poth, 2015).

3.1 Phenomenological Study

The study explored the lived experiences of White faculty who engage in honest racial discussions. The phenomenological methodology describes the lived experiences of a phenomenon or event that has taken place (Creswell

& Poth, 2015). Phenomenological methods help understand how people interpret their experiences and can assist in making meaning of those experiences (Creswell & Poth, 2015; Hays & Singh, 2023).

Although phenomenological studies assist with understanding a specific phenomenon, the methodology inherently involves subjectivity. In qualitative research, the researcher is the instrument used to collect and often interpret collected data. This analysis method can lend itself to assumptions, emotions, and prejudices that impact the study (Hays & Singh, 2023). Further, participants in phenomenological studies, such as this one, are carefully selected and screened to ensure they experience the same occurrence (Creswell, 2015).

3.2 Participant Characteristics

Participants were White counselor educators who teach multicultural counseling at a predominantly White Institution.

3.3 Procedure

Data collection took place in two parts using semi-structured interviews. In Part I, we posed the open-ended questions to participants via Qualtrics to stimulate a conversational tone, approximate natural expressions, and elicit spontaneous incidents of describing the phenomenon. We then transcribed the open-ended responses to drive follow-up focus group discussions (Part II). A list of follow-up questions was generated, making the entire process a semi-structured interview (Jamshed, 2014). The focus group promoted self-disclosure among participants, encouraging them to share their experiences as White faculty who engaged in honest classroom discussions on race and racism. In addition, participants explored perceptions, feelings, and thoughts about issues, ideas, services, and opportunities related to their instructional experiences. The semi-structured and open-ended interview process allowed participants to share their voices and represent their experiences in their way. The first and second authors participated in the interviewing. The third author gathered, cleaned, and analyzed the data. The questions disseminated via Qualtrics are listed.

Table 1. Questions disseminated	to participants
---------------------------------	-----------------

Question 1	Why is it important to honestly discuss race and racism?
Question 2	 How did you become comfortable with such provocative dialogue? a) What are your challenges in maintaining openness? b) What are the gains (if any) from a White person who is able and willing to engage in difficult dialogues (such as race/racism)? c) Are there any suggestions for the counseling profession to encourage future (White) counselor educators to take up a similar discussion practice?

As shown in Table 1, two primary questions and three subquestions were posed to participants.

3.4 Trustworthiness

Trustworthiness relies upon several strategies to maximize the study's credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability (Wolcott, 2001). Four trustworthiness criteria include credibility, transferability, conformability, and ethics (Hays & Singh, 2023). It was essential to use appropriate techniques to enhance the trustworthiness of this study. The researchers met the criteria as evidenced by member checking, triangulation, simultaneous data collection and analysis, thick description, audit trail, and auditor review (Hays & Singh, 2012). In addition, the primary researcher-maintained transparency through detailed reports of the research steps taken. Those steps consisted of (a) raw data, (b) data reduction and analysis products, (c) data reconstruction and synthesis products, (d) process notes, (e) materials relating to intentions and dispositions, and (f) semi-structured open-ended question development information (Lovitts, 2001).

3.5 Credibility

Credibility is related to the reality and believability of the research findings (Hays & Singh, 2023) and involves two processes. The first process includes believably conducting research. The second is determining if the study's findings are correct and accurate. Lincoln and Guba (1985) suggest that prolonged engagement and persistent observation embrace the study's credibility. The researchers in this study engaged in research and data analysis triangulation to increase the study's credibility (Hays & Singh, 2023). Although there was a primary or lead in the interviewing, the second author was present for all the interviews and monitored the discussion. Also, the second author confirmed the data analysis (Merriam, 2009). The researchers discussed the overall process in formal meetings throughout the research process. Any differences or inconsistencies were compared and resolved (Hays & Singh, 2023).

4. Results

The three participants were full-time counselor educators for 8, 21, and 27 years. They all have taught multicultural counseling courses numerous times. One even mentioned that "every class is a multicultural counseling course." All three

of them taught both masters and Ph.D. level courses. They also reported having a generally diverse student body in their classes, with 38% African American or Black students and 12% Hispanic students on average.

5. Design Analysis

Participant responses were manually highlighted, coded, and grouped according to the similarity in content. As was the case in the present study, "coding was a progressive process of sorting and defining and defining and sorting those scraps of collected data" (Glesne, 1999, p. 135). The emergent themes were data-driven in that no preconceived categories or thematic patterns drove the coding of the results. Units of analysis were identified and coded for emerging themes. To provide a form of "investigator triangulation" (Patton, 2014, p. 247), one of the researchers examined the categorization of pieces to offer alternative interpretations.

The first outer level (Level 1) described the participants' initial surface-level responses to the open-ended questions. The second level (Level 2) represented a thematic analysis of transcripts distilled from the coding process and interpreted from the essence of the group follow-up interview. Three salient themes emerged from the data.

5.1 Theme 1: Creating a safe space for conversations.

A safe space is a place or environment where a person can feel confident that they will not be discriminated against, criticized, harassed, or exposed to other emotional or physical harm. Faculty are encouraged to build areas that offer controversy with civility, respect, no attacks, and challenges by choice. Participants spoke of the importance of allowing authenticity, vulnerability, and safety in all spaces to create honest and constructive race-related conversations.

Quote 1	From the second I walked into the classroom on the first day of class, what am I doing to create a container where when we need to have these conversations, it is their right that their safety is created from the beginning? Part of that is ensuring our voices are heard from the beginning in safer conversations. Moreover, that people that everyone in the room knows that I value them as a scholar, students, and human beings.
Quote 2	There are times when the room gets so regulated that I must step in from my position are we are going to take a pause. We are going to have this conversation. We cannot have it right now because I hear the emotionality in the room. And then we will take a break and do whatever we need to do; sometimes it is okay, so we will return to this next week because I want whoever has experienced something that hurt them. I want them to know I am not saying no; we cannot discuss this. I always want to make sure that it is a clear message. However, we cannot have a productive conversation now because of emotional dysregulation. Moreover, that is, again, that's attachment theory right when we are dysregulated and out of our minds.

Table 2. Theme 1: Creating a safe space for conversations

As shown in Table 2, participants described their experience creating and maintaining a safe conversation space.

5.2 Theme 2: Being okay with Being Imperfect

Welcoming imperfection as perfection allows one the opportunity to succeed. Embracing imperfection is more like accepting reality. In conversations in and out of class with students and colleagues, participants shared that they embraced imperfections and actively engaged in corrective practices whenever a teaching moment related to racial issues arose.

Table 3. Theme 2: Being okay with being imperfect

Quote 1	You know I messed up, and I think you do. I hope that students, colleagues, and friends know it is coming from a place where I have had a blind spot; it is ignorance, not malice, nothing nasty in that, but I make mistakes and so on.
Quote 2	The issue will be if I screw up and someone lets me know I screw up, and I do not do anything about it, that becomes the issue. Hence, the problem is how we engage in recovery, so recognizing that there was a misinterpretation, or I said something hurtful, or I did something was hurtful. It does not matter. I do not think ethnicity; is just human.
Quote 3	It is a tricky one for me, but I know what I can do is be human. To the imperfect and to acknowledge where I make missteps to me is crucial, and many academics could be

	better at that; quite frankly, there are many egos.
Quote 4	One of the biggest things that are so important in this work is being able to say I was wrong and sorry. Like being able to own my mistakes - and be willing to talk about my mistakes in front of students in class; you know they say I am not perfect; here are the ways that I have made mistakes; here are the ways that I have engaged in harm and here is how you know I have tried to do better, I think I must be a role model. And imperfect role model.

As shown in Table 3, participants described the need to be okay with being imperfect.

5.3 Theme 3: Encounters That Transform

Candid conversations that lead to inclusive excellence, particularly concerning anti-racism education and pedagogy. Participants spoke of dramatic changes in form that led to outward appearance and character of themselves.

Table 4. Theme 3: Encounters that transform

Subtheme	Context	Participant Quotes
Subtheme 1: Constructing Intentional Relationships with Truth	Participants shared that they sought the support of "truth tellers," who had no qualms about pointing out participants' unintentional or implicit offenses.	The people who will call me yet and will love me and smack me in the back of the head gently and say, hey, you missed this, or you said this the wrong way, or what have you? I just had one of those experiences this weekend where I commented was sitting with - a person of color who just looked at me was just it was a look, no words, and I paused, and I went, wow yeah, that is That was a statement of privilege - And it was a little head nod. I sat back, and for about two minutes, there was no conversation because I needed to sit with it, and this person got that.
		Someone will say hey, do you know you realize how that might have landed. Well, no, I did not. Thank you for pointing that out. So the first thing is gratitude that somebody will invest in me and pour into me to say, "Hey, look at that right that thing that you missed."
Subtheme 2: Worldview-Changing Experiences.Tellers	Some events throughout the participants' lives influenced how they saw people. Participants talked about the worldview-changing experiences that afforded them an open mind toward race and racial issues.	I do think my journey for me started with a director of minority affairs at my undergrad who, you know, sat me down and had a conversation with me; she sat me down and covered me with post-it notes one day - and said, you know these are your types of privilege that you have; here are the ones that I think you know about, and then she put some on my back, and she is like these are the ones that you do not know about - And you know - you have to make a decision - this question was so transformational for me, not at that moment, but over my journey, it was one that I kept coming back to; how are you going to use your privilege? for good or for evil.
		I could look back and go, why was I called 'Miss' Lauren (pseudonym), and my best friend, who is African American, was called Carolyn? Why was that the norm? I began to question that experience and those experiences. Then I think traveling globally has significantly impacted me, and I lived globally, so I have lived in Costa Rica and other countries. And I have to say, being a minority in a

	culture where I was a minority gave me a completely different perspective; even living in Hawaii for five years was a very humbling experience.	
	Because I went to college, I worked for six years for the Boys & Girls Clubs and was routinely the only White person in the building. And those ten years, four years at university, and six years at the Boys & Girls Club was a period of deconstruction for me - I had beliefs that I did not even know were beliefs, and without some experience to start deconstructing that, I could not reconstruct anything different.	
Subtheme3:Transformationalencountersthroughcontemplativepedagogy(and vice versa)	Participants described ways in which principles and practices of contemplative pedagogy empowered their teaching experiences. Being contemplative, reflective, and principled was vital in dealing with challenging racial issues in	I feel like many counselor educators get so caught up in the content of what they are teaching that they forget about the process; if we apply the same skills that we have as counselors to the processes that we have in the counseling education program, I think we would see many different outcomes
their work.	I think about our faculty and the people I feel engage in antiracist approaches; they focus on the process. You know more, so I think the content gets more covered in some cases than the content. However, they are looking at how the student is and experiencing themselves, how they are experiencing the world around them, and how they are engaging. They spend time talking to students about this and encouraging them to talk to each other about this process.	

As shown in Table 4, participants described their unique and transformative experiences.

6. Discussion

In this phenomenological study, we explored the lived experiences of White counselor educators who regularly engaged in honest discussions on race and racism. Furthermore, we were interested in knowing from the participants' perspective why such discussions were essential and how they became comfortable with such provocative dialogues. The investigations produced three significant themes: constructing relationships with intentional truth-tellers, world-view-changing experiences, and transformational encounters through contemplative pedagogy. Each of these themes (and respective sub-themes) adequately answered the driving questions of this inquiry.

Truth disrupts the status quo and levels the playing field. "Truth tellers call us higher and make us mindful, conscious people who care about the greater good" (Abercrombie, 2019, p.45). In her book, Abercrombie encourages brutal honesty and ceasing of silence, linking the quiet to a fear to speak the truth. She says truth-tellers allow us to heal and live more fruitful lives. The participants in this study validated Abercrombie's position through their usage and acknowledgment of the importance of the truth-teller. If one wants to develop the skill to have difficult conversations about race, then one needs to join with people who will say what needs to be said (truth tellers) and do what needs to be done. More importantly, participants in this study intentionally sought out truth-tellers, constantly engaged themselves in self-reflection, and took the initiative to modify behaviors when needed, all of which are essential qualities for counselor educators to develop.

It is well-documented that world-changing events or exposure increase one's cultural competence (Liu, 2014). Such experiences contribute to knowledge and awareness, allowing individuals to select and use appropriate tools when interacting with other cultural groups (Crowne, 2013). For example, close encounters with people of color and people from different cultures instilled respect for diversity and cultural humility in participants in this study.

Lastly, contemplative pedagogy involves teaching methods that cultivate deepened awareness, concentration, and insight. Meditation, mindfulness, and yoga are typical examples of contemplative practices. Those counselor educators who can purposefully focus their students' attention on themselves, their behaviors, and their worldviews can get better aid in transforming their practice. Not only does the data support the literature (theme three), but the data also present if contemplative pedagogy is the act of counselor educators engaging in honest discussions on race and racism.

Contemplative pedagogy is the regeneration of beliefs -making them more inclusive, less discriminatory, open, and emotionally capable of change. Contemplative pedagogy is an act of social justice (Wilson, 2021).

7. Implications for Counselor Education

The results from this study indicated ways to develop and engage in difficult dialogues. Moreover, given our ACA ethical obligation, the field of counselor education is committed to establishing and maintaining multicultural competence and social justice (ACA Code of Ethics Preamble, 2014). Understanding the connection between the faculty and antiracist pedagogy is critical. Blakeney (2005) describes antiracist pedagogy as "a paradigm located within the Critical Theory utilized to explain and counteract the persistence and impact of racism using praxis as its focus to promote social justice for the creation of a democratic society in every respect" (p. 119). Antiracist pedagogy (as evidenced by an honest discussion about race and racism) reflects an action-oriented approach to racism that calls for integrating racism into the curriculum (Kishimoto, 2018). White faculty can leverage their privilege to bring about significant change; adopting an antiracist pedagogy could assist in validating race-related experiences for counseling students of color and exemplify professional excellence for most students.

8. Conclusion

Counselor educators are critical in fostering an inclusive learning community inside and outside the classroom. Although this is true of all counselor educators, the most excellent opportunity for transformational growth, learning, and understanding comes from White faculty who are courageous enough to consistently engage in honest and provocative racial conversations with students and colleagues from minoritized groups. Chan et al. (2018) noted that White faculty might be hesitant to engage in dialogue centered on privilege and oppression due to fear of adverse reactions by students. As demonstrated in the current research, White counselor educators traverse such challenges by owning their privilege, surrounding themselves with truth-tellers, and creating a safe environment to engage in controversial dialogue with civility. Underscoring these elements requires embracing imperfection and being committed to self-reflexivity.

Future research should include more robust data collection strategies. For example, researchers could ensure that interviewers are less likely to have apparent biases of personal identification (e.g., White faculty members) when interviewing participants.

Another consideration for future research is using quantitative methods to examine whether a relationship exists between White racial identity and their proficiency in facilitating honest conversations on race and racism. Such a study could be informative for recruiting, mentoring, and retaining faculty members within counselor education.

Finally, future researchers may consider further investigating the role and function of truth-tellers in counselor education. The outcome of such research may yield practical strategies for identifying truth-tellers in counselor education and enhancing overall cultural humility.

References

- Abercrombie, A. (2019). Rise of the truth-teller: Own your story, tell it like it is, and live with holy gumption. Baker Books.
- American Counseling Association. (2014). 2014 ACA code of ethics. Retrieved from https://www.counseling.org/docs/default-source/default-document-library/2014-code-of-ethics-finaladdress.pdf

Atkins, K., & Lorelle, S. (2022). Cultural humility: Lessons learned through a counseling cultural immersion. *Journal of Counselor Preparation and Supervision*, 15(1), 9. Retrieved from https://go.openathens.net/redirector/liberty.edu?url=https://www.proquest.com/scholarly-journals/cultural-humility -lessons-learned-through/docview/2664898900/se-2

- Bernard, H. R. (2013). Social research methods: Qualitative and quantitative approaches. SAGE Publications.
- Brooks, M., Alston, G., Townsend, C., & Bryan, M. (2017). Creating a healthy classroom environment in multicultural counseling courses. *Journal of Human Services: Training, Research, and Practice*, 2(1), 1-24.
- Chan, C. D., Cor, D. N., & Band, M. P. (2018). Privilege and oppression in counselor education: An intersectionality framework, *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, 46(1), 58-73. https://doi.org/10.1002/jmcd.12092
- Council for Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs. (2015). 2016 CACREP standards. Retrieved from_www.cacrep.org/for-programs/2016-cacrep-standards
- Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (2018). *Research design: qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approach* (5th ed.). SAGE.
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2015). Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches. AGE.

- Crowne, K. A. (2013). Cultural exposure, emotional intelligence, and cultural intelligence: An exploratory study. *International Journal of Cross-Cultural Management*, 13(1), 5-22. https://doi.org/10.1177/1470595812452633
- Dalton, H. L. (1995). Racial healing: Confronting the fear between Blacks and Whites. Doubleday.
- Ferriera, A., & Santoso, A. (2008). Do students' perceptions matter? A study of the effect of students' perceptions on academic performance. *Accounting & Finance*, 48(2), 209-231. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-629X.2007.00239.x
- Glesne, C. (1999). Becoming qualitative researchers: An introduction. Longman.
- Haskins, N. H., & Singh, A. (2015). Critical race theory and counselor education pedagogy: Creating equitable training. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 54, 288-301. https://doi.org/10.1002/ceas.12027
- Hays, D. G., & Singh, A. A. (2023). *Qualitative research in education and Social Sciences*. Cognella Academic Publishing.
- Jamshed S. (2014). Qualitative research method-interviewing and observation. *Journal of basic and clinical pharmacy*, 5(4), 87-88. https://doi.org/10.4103/0976-0105.141942
- Kivel, P. (1996). Uprooting racism: How White people can work for racial justice. New Society.
- Liu, S. (2014). Becoming intercultural: Exposure to foreign cultures and intercultural competence of students. *China Media Research*, 10, 7-14.
- Merriam, S. B. (2009). Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation (3rd ed.). Jossey-Bass.
- Otter, R., Seipel, S., Graeff, T., Alexander, B., Boraiko, C., Gray, J., Peterson, K., and Sadler, K. (2013). Comparing student and faculty perceptions of online and traditional courses. *Internet and Higher Education*, 19, 27-35. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.iheduc.2013.08.001
- Patton, & Patton, M. Q. (2002). Qualitative research and evaluation methods (3rd ed). Sage.
- Patton, M. Q. (2014). Qualitative research & evaluation methods (4th ed.). Sage.
- Ratts, M. J., Singh, A. A., Nassar-McMillan, S., Butler, S. K., & McCullough, J. R. (2016). Multicultural and social justice counseling competencies: Guidelines for the counseling profession. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, 44(1), 28-48. https://doi.org/10.1002/jmcd.12035
- Roysircar, G., Gard, G., Hubbell, R., & Ortega, M. (2005). Development of counseling trainees' multicultural awareness through mentoring students of English as a second language. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, 33(1), 17-36. https://doi.org/10.1002/j.2161-1912.2005.tb00002.x
- Schwalbe, M. (2009). Inequality and the seductions of false community. Michigan Sociological Review, 23, 1-30.
- Solorzano, D. G., & Yosso, T. J. (2001). From racial stereotyping and deficit discourse toward a critical race theory in teacher education. *Multicultural education*, 9(1), 2.
- Solorzano, D., Ceja, M., & Yosso, T. (2000). Critical race theory, racial microaggressions, and campus racial climate: The experiences of African American college students. *Journal of Negro Education*, 69(1/2), 60.
- Sue, D. W. (2005). Racism and the conspiracy of silence: Presidential address. *The Counseling Psychologist*, 33(1), 100-114. https://doi.org/10.1177/0011000004270686
- Sue, D. W., Capodilupo, C. M., Torino, G. C., Bucceri, J. M., Holder, A. M. B., Nadal, K. L., & Esquilin, M. E. (2007). Racial microaggressions in everyday life: Implications for clinical practice. *The American Psychologist*, 62(4), 271-286. https://doi.org/10.1037/0003-066X.62.4.271
- Sue, D. W., Lin, A. I., Torino, G. C., Capodilupo, C. M., & Rivera, D. P. (2009). Racial microaggressions and difficult dialogues in the classroom. *Cultural Diversity & Ethnic Minority Psychology*, 15(2), 183-190. https://doi.org/10.1037/a0014191
- Sue, D. W., Rivera, D. P., Watkins, N. L., Kim, R. H., Kim, S., & Williams, C. D. (2011). Racial dialogues: Challenges faculty of color face in the classroom. *Cultural Diversity & Ethnic Minority Psychology*, 17(3), 331-340. https://doi.org/10.1037/a0024190
- Tatum, B. D. (1997). Why are all the Black kids sitting together in the cafeteria? And other conversations about race (First). BasicBooks.
- Tervalon, M., & Murray-Garcia, J. (1998). Cultural humility versus cultural competence: A critical distinction in defining physician training outcomes in multicultural education. *Journal of Health Care for the Poor and Underserved*, 9(2), 117-25. https://doi.org/10.1353/hpu.2010.0233

- Toporek, R. L., Ortega-Villalobos, L., & Pope-Davis, D. B. (2004). Critical incidents in multicultural supervision: exploring supervisees' and supervisors' experiences. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, *32*(2), 66-83. https://doi.org/10.1002/j.2161-1912.2004.tb00362.x
- Whittaker, T. T. (2019). Get off my property": A personal narrative addressing violence against African Americans by law enforcement post–hurricane Katrina. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, 47, 161-171. https://doi.org/10.1002/jmcd.12139
- Willow, R. A. (2008). The lived experience of interracial dialogue on race: proclivity to participate. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, *36*(1), 40-51. https://doi.org/10.1002/j.2161-1912.2008.tb00068.x
- Wilson, C. (2021). A contemplative pedagogy: The practice of presence when the present is overwhelming. *Journal of Transformative Learning*, 8(1), 52-62.
- Wolcott. (2009). Writing up qualitative research (3rd ed.). Sage. https://doi.org/10.4135/9781452234878
- Wood, J. T. (2012). Interpersonal communication: Everyday encounters (7th ed.). Cengage Learning.
- Yeager, K. A., & Bauer-Wu, S. (2013). Cultural humility: Essential foundation for clinical researchers. Applied Nursing Research, 26(4), 251-256. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apnr.2013.06.008
- Zhu, L., M., & Bellini, J. (2021). A grounded theory analysis of cultural humility in counseling and counselor education. *Counselor Education and Supervision.*, 60(1), 73-89. https://doi.org/10.1002/ceas.12197

Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal.

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the <u>Creative Commons Attribution license</u> which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.